

PUBLIC POLICY AND SOCIAL SCIENCES

ISHRAT HUSAIN¹

The topic that was assigned to me by the organizers of this Conference was “Public Policy towards Social Sciences”. They thought that given my life long preoccupation as public policy practitioner and the recent responsibilities as Chairman, HEC, Social Sciences Committee I would be able to do justice with this topic. Upon reflection I concluded that all one could say that there was no public policy towards social sciences. I could have taken the easy path out and lamented on the dismal state of the social sciences in Pakistan, the step motherly treatment given to social sciences, the lack of resources given to social sciences but these protestations and lamentations have become part of the common folklore and I couldn’t add anything more.

2. I have therefore taken the liberty of taking on a different slant on this topic and decided to address the following questions:-

- a) What are the main public policy challenges facing Pakistan and are likely to be confronted in the future too?
- b) Why have the social scientists not been able to contribute to discourse on these challenges in an informed manner?
- c) What can be done to promote social science research on public policy issues?

PUBLIC POLICY CHALLENGES

3. I would submit that Pakistan faces at least eight major challenges that are likely to persist in the future also. It is my belief that the social scientists can make a difference by enhancing our understanding of these issues, analyzing them systematically and suggesting possible options. These challenges are listed below:-

1. Governance deficit
2. Trust deficit
3. Distributional inequities.
4. Underdeveloped human resources
5. Competitiveness lag.
6. Identity crisis.
7. Self-Confidence deficit
8. Food-Water-Energy crisis

4. I will now briefly elaborate on the nature of each of these challenges:-

Governance Deficit

¹ A paper presented at the Workshop on Social Sciences organized by Government College University on March 27, 2008 at Lahore.

5. There is very little disagreement that Pakistan's governance broadly defined as the right balance between the Legislature, Executive and Judiciary, the nature of Civil-Military relationship, the State-Society interface and the delivery of basic services to the citizens suffers from serious weaknesses and structural deficiencies. The leakages, waste, corruption and inefficiency rampant in the production and distribution of public goods or public sector managed goods and services have lowered the potential economic output and skewed the distribution of benefits from growth. Not only is this governance deficit limited to the economy but extends to other spheres of activity. Weiss and Gilani (2001) put it succinctly.

“The traditional centers of powers and authority within the social fabric of society are eroding seemingly without any coherent alternatives. What results are social breakdowns and random acts of violence coupled with institutional inefficiency and corruption? These are unanticipated every day responses to thus unparalleled institutional malaise. The loss of a “social contract” between Pakistanis seems to have wreaked havoc not only in the economy but throughout the country's infrastructure, in the educational system, the government bureaucracy, the economy and even in the arts.”

6. Their observations applied to pre-2001 period but the breakdown in the law and order and security conditions, and the recent confrontation between the judiciary and the executive branches seem to have aggravated the situation. The state's inability to establish the rule of law and secure property and lives of the citizens shows the depth of governance problems facing the country.

7. The insensitivity of the administrative system in Pakistan to the needs of the poor is well known but has been very well depicted in the following excerpts from the Human Development Report in South Asia.

“South Asia presents a fascinating combination of many contradictions. It has governments that are high on governing and low on serving; it has parliaments that are elected by the poor but aid the rich; and society that asserts the rights of some but perpetuates exclusion for others. Despite a marked improvement in the lives of a few, there are many in South Asia who have been forgotten by formal institutions of governance. These are the poor, the downtrodden and the most vulnerable of the society, suffering from acute deprivation on account of their income, caste, creed, gender or religion. Their fortunes have not moved with those of the privileged few and this in itself is a deprivation of a depressing nature”.

(Human Development South Asia Report, 1999)

“Governance constitutes for {ordinary people} a daily struggle for survival and dignity. Ordinary people are too often humiliated at the hands of public institutions. For them, lack of good governance means police brutality, corruption in accessing basic public services, ghost schools, teachers absenteeism, missing medicines, high cost of and low access to justice, criminalization of politics and lack of social justice. These are just few manifestations of the crisis of governance”.

8. The questions that need to be addressed are: How can the institutions of governance be strengthened, the devolution of powers to local tiers made more effective and the interface between the ordinary citizen and government functionaries be improved?

Trust Deficit

9. Why is trust among people, communities, and regions living in a society or nation important? “Trust reduces transaction costs, avoids future disputes and litigation, eases settlement of contracts and acts as a lubricant for facilitating businesses and economic activity”.

10. Unlike China, Pakistan is one of the countries which suffer from Trust Deficit or low social capital. The reason for this phenomenon are historical and structural. The Punjabis and Mohajirs have always been over represented in bureaucracy and the army – the two traditional bastions of power in Pakistan. The demographic balance in the United Pakistan which was in favour of East Pakistan got heavily tilted towards Punjab in the post-1971 Pakistan. The representation in political institutions exercising state authority was rejigged on the basis of population. With 56 percent of the population the national finances also got distributed using population as the only variable for allocation. It was perceived by the smaller provinces that being upper riparian on the Indus River system and holding large underground water resources the already fertile lands of Punjab receive disproportionate benefits from reservoirs and storage dams. The fierce opposition to Kalabagh Dam – technically and financially a worthwhile investment – by the smaller provinces represents a clear manifestation of this Trust deficit.

11. The over centralized nature of the Federal Government taking over responsibilities that rightly belongs to the provinces and pre-empting the bulk share of the Divisible pool of the national finances have further intensified the disharmonious and conflicted character of social order in the country.

12. The ethnocentrism within the country and ethnic tensions within the provincial boundaries such as Mohajirs vs Sindhis, Balochs vs Pakhtoons, Saraiki vs Punjabis and Pakhtoons vs non-Pakhtoons are all derived from the larger struggle for autonomy and fair and just allocation of resources. Sensible win-win solutions are shelved due to mistrust, suspicion and a perception of unjust outcome likely to hurt the community's interests.

13. According to World Bank research (2005) “Fairer Societies offer their citizens more public goods, more social support and more social capital. Hence they are more capable of sharing the costs and benefits of improving economic policies and in turn facilitating consensus building and decision making”

14. What are the causes of this lack of trust and how can trust be restored are ripe issues for social scientists to analyze systematically. Social capital theory can perhaps shed some light on this topic.

Distributional Inequities.

15. Pakistan has successfully practised the capitalist model of development since 1960s excepting a reversal to socialist model in the 1970s. There is a broad consensus among the major political parties that the policies of Deregulation, Liberalization and Privatization ought to be pursued for achieving rapid economic growth by relying on private sector. Where there is difference of opinion is on the role the state should play in steering the economy. Capitalist model is quite efficient as far as accumulation and growth are concerned because the market mechanism produces relatively better allocation and utilization of resources. What is missing, however, is that the markets reward only those who are well endowed with physical or human capital and therefore those who lack endowments other than unskilled labour get by passed by this process. The state therefore has to step in with Taxation and Expenditure policy, Agriculture and Industrial Policies, Education and Health Policies, Social safety nets and transfers to improve the well being of the poor and vulnerable segments of the society. When inter-personal income distribution is accompanied by regional, gender or ethnic inequities the temperature for social conflict and tension rises high. In Pakistan, there is a widely believed perception that the rich and middle classes are the main beneficiaries of high economic growth while the poor and fixed income groups have become relatively worse off. Behavioral economists have demonstrated in recent years that it is the relative income that ignites an individual's response. While absolute poverty may have declined the fact that the bottom 20 percent of the households earn only 6-7 percent of the national income while almost 50 percent of national income accrues to top 20 percent is a matter of serious concern. If these top 20 percent households are concentrated in urban areas of Punjab and Sindh and are headed by males the feeling of exasperation among the deprived communities is further accentuated adding fuel to the existing ethnic tensions.

16. What insights from Sociology, Political Science, Islamic Studies and Economics can be brought together to bear upon the distributional issues? How can the political economy be realigned with the goal of better distribution? Economists have failed to find a satisfactory answer so far. Perhaps political scientists and Sociologists can be a better job.

Underdeveloped Human Resources

17. Despite an impressive record of high economic growth over a sixty year period that is matched by only a few developing countries Pakistan suffers from weak human indicators in relation to the countries in the same income group.

18. Pakistan ranks 134th among 177 countries on Human Development Index. About one half of the adult population is illiterate. Enrolment ratios at all levels - Primary, secondary and tertiary – are dismally low. Tertiary education ratio is only 4 percent. Hardly a few thousand professionals are produced every year. This dearth of skilled manpower cuts across all the dynamic sectors of the economy – oil and gas, telecommunications, IT, financial services, electronic media etc.

19. Health indicators are equally bad. Maternal mortality and Infant Mortality rates are among the worst in the developing countries. Population growth rate is relatively higher than India and Bangladesh. Access to potable drinking water and sanitation is of uneven quality and water-borne diseases are quite common.

20. During the last eight years a lot of attention has been given and resources allocated to improve access to higher education and strengthening engineering and science education. But the level of instruction at the college level that prepares the candidates for university and post graduate education and also the job market remains highly unsatisfactory. The graduates do not have analytical skills, problem solving abilities, critical thinking and the ability to apply knowledge acquired. The divide between Education and Employment therefore remains wide.

21. How can the demographic dividend i.e a young population be translated into comparative advantage for Pakistani economy in the globalized world at the time when Japan and European Countries will be faced with ageing population? Is public expenditure on education and health the only factor retarding human development or are there some other binding constraints?

Competitiveness Lag

22. Sanctity of property rights and rule of law, independent courts, modern education sound macro economic management, political stability, openness to foreign trade and foreign investment, freedom of thought and scientific inquiry are some of the common ingredients that are found among the countries that have risen on the competitiveness ladder in the recent years.

23. Pakistan is still stuck with low technology production structure in agriculture and industry. The dominant reliance on four major crops in agriculture and low value added textiles for too long has relegated Pakistan to the bottom rung of competitiveness. Innovation, enterprise and risk taking by Pakistani businesses are conspicuously missing. Scientific research and development efforts by either public sector or private sector organizations are almost non-existent. Institutions of higher education produce low quality professional and managerial manpower that possesses little employable skills. Vocational and technical training that supports high level manpower in industry is inadequate both in numbers of technicians produced and in the acquisition of practical techniques. The average years of schooling completed by an average labor force worker is 3 to 4 years only. Eighty percent of the female population does not participate in the labor force and those who do are mainly unpaid family workers engaged on their farms in the rural areas. Pakistan's exports are largely textiles which is not a dynamic product category for expansion in world markets. This competitiveness lag places Pakistan in a highly precarious position vis-a-vis other developing countries in Asia in this globalized economy. Pakistan ranks 91st in the Global Competitiveness Index out of 125 countries.

24. Competitiveness has enabled South Koreans and Taiwanis to move so fast into newly created jobs in electronics, computers, memory chips that lost jobs barely register in the unemployment statistics. In South Korea, the jobless rate is 2.6 percent; in Taiwan it is 1-4 percent. The Chinese have been snapping up 20 percent of South Korea's auto exports in recent years.

25. How can the business culture be altered and invigorated so that they can identify and seize upon the emerging opportunities in the world market? What are the measures that can promote risk taking and innovation among the businesses? How can R&D Organizations be revamped and propelled to action?

Identity Crises

26. Christophe Jaffrelot (2002) in his introductory chapter quotes an observation that aptly sums up the identity crisis faced by Pakistan since its independence.

“Since its inception, Pakistan has faced the monumental task to spell out an identity different from the Indian identity. Born from the division of the old civilization of India, Pakistan has struggled for constructing its own culture, a culture which would not only be different from the Indian Culture but that the whole world would acknowledge”

Those who propound the national security state thesis believe that the security establishment has purposely kept the fear of India trying to break up Pakistan alive to

perpetuate their ascendancy. In response the Indian intrusion in 1971 and their efforts to play up the sentiments of minority ethnic groups in Pakistan against the established state are cited as examples of India's "nefarious design" on Pakistan.

27. Ayesha Jalal (1994) argues that Jinnah was a nationalist in quest of his nation. She asserts that Islam provided him the cultural basis for an ideology of ethnic nationalism that was intended to mobilize the Muslim community in order to defend the minoritarian Muslims.

28. Zia's Islamization policy, his proactive support and nurturing of Afghan Mujahideen for Jihad against the Soviets, the growing ascendancy of violent sectarian organizations fuelling unrest in Kashmir, the emergence of Taliban in the late 1990s in Afghanistan with strong links with Pakistan's ISI and the participation of war against terror in post September 2001 period have led to a thinking of "Islam as the bedrock for building the nation" (Shafqat Saeed, 2003)

29. How can these conflicting orientations be reconciled? What is the true identity of Pakistani nation? These questions require in-depth historical research combined with Islamic studies, sociology and political science.

Self-Confidence deficit.

30. Pakistanis, by and large, have developed a highly cynical and negative psyche. Insecurity of the state i.e. the fear of reabsorption by India, the experience of separation of East Pakistan, the poor track record of the credibility of our successive leaders have all contributed to this psyche. But this is harmful in the long run as lack of national self esteem becomes a barrier to national development.

31. Prof. M.A. Qadeer (2006) has very ably described the Pakistani mindset which truly reflects the insecurity and deficit of self confidence. According to him, we blame some one malevolent who is thought to be pulling strings or presume that conspiracy is the driving force behind many events. It is not only default explanation in personal matters but is often the first cause presumed in national and international events. Lack of acknowledgment of one's own impotence and a justification for inaction have become the mainstream thinking in Pakistan and a barrier to objective and inductive thinking.

32. This mindset also explains the highly cynical and negative reactions and responses of most Pakistanis. We as a nation cannot do anything good ourselves and all that good happens is because of others' goodwill or charity. If the economy has turned around it is

the gift of Sept. 11 events and nothing to do with the efforts of millions of Pakistani workers, businessmen or farmers who contributed to it. Wheat, sugar shortages occur mainly because of the mafias and cartels who hoard the commodities but not due to imbalances in domestic demand and supply and consequent mismanagement.

33. The phobia and excessive preoccupation with the U.S. dominate our national psyche. Governments in Pakistan are widely believed to be formed and removed by the U.S. The ordinary Pakistanis although they have exercised their voting rights seven times during last 23 years, have nothing to do with the changes in government. If Pakistan records growth rate of 7 percent or decline in poverty rate these happy outcomes are attributed to fudging of figures but if the same official data shows inflation rate of 10-12 percent these figures are readily believed and used as a stick to beat the government in power. We have developed a unique tendency in the world to disbelieve and discount any good news about our country or our people and to exaggerate the negatives beyond any proportions. This is evident in the popularity of newspaper columnists, TV anchors and discussants who are highly negative and pessimistic in their comments and paint doom-and-gloom day scenario. Those who present a more balanced and even handed picture do not find any space in the newspapers. Nor are they invited to the TV channels.

34. Why have we developed such a deep sense of insecurity and lack of self-esteem as a nation? What can be done to overcome this malaise? Psychologists, Sociologists and mass media specialists have to put their brains together to come up with answers to these questions.

Food –Water- Energy Crisis

35. The recent hike in international prices of food and commodities, the stress on dwindling water resources in the country and the energy shortages have deeper implications for the sustenance of the common citizen and the competitiveness of Pakistan's businesses. The higher profitability in food production would induce the agrarian structure to continue to move towards owner self cultivation with the marginalization of the landless poor in the agrarian economy. The shortfall in irrigation water supply would make agriculture output move volatile making earnings unstable for the small farmers. The rising cost of inputs deter the small and subsistence farmers from increasing their yields and sharing the gains from high food prices. Small Tubewell owners and leasees are hit by the rising prices of fuel.

36. The demand- supply imbalances of energy in Pakistan are currently met through recourse to highly expensive thermal power generation. This is an unsustainable situation both from public finances viewpoint and the cost of doing business. Other cheaper sources such as hydro-electricity are no longer being tapped due to the trust deficit between the upper and lower riparian provinces. The energy crisis may erode the competitiveness of Pakistan products in the world markets and reduce the quantum of foreign exchange earnings putting pressure on the country's balance of payments.

37. How can alternative energy sources be developed? What can be done to bring a consensus for tapping the hydro electric potential and water storage? What are the efficient ways in which water and energy resources can be conserved?

RESPONSE OF SOCIAL SCIENTISTS.

38. Why have the social scientists not been able to contribute to discourse on these challenges when it is quite clear from the above cataloguing that this is a fertile ground for research in sociology, anthropology, political science, history, philosophy, psychology, public administration, law, organizational development etc. Such a daunting agenda would provoke and excite any set of academics and researchers in investigating and producing plethora of interesting and useful work that can form the basis of discourse and discussion and influence policy outcomes directly and indirectly. In any other country there would be hundreds of books titles, thousands of journal articles and popular commentaries flowing out of this work. But this is not happening in Pakistan. Instead of pinning the blame on the usual suspects it would be illuminating to ponder over the factors that are intervening between this agenda of researchable questions and the lack of response by the academic community. There may be other factors but I have chosen only a few that seems to be playing a significant role.

39. First, it must be conceded that at present there are a lot of misgivings and reservations on the part of both the social scientists as well as public policy practitioners. Social scientists believe that the generalist – bureaucrats do not care and attach any importance to scientific studies. They only act upon intuition, get feelings, experiential learning and that's why the quality of decision making in the government is so poor. The anti-intellectual bias of the policy makers is obvious by the low value they accord to intellectual work, the low status given to intellectuals in the society and the "capture" of policy making by feudal elites and other powerful interest groups. The result is ad-hocism all across. Inayatullah (2003) and the contributors to that volume refer to these factors in their analysis.

40. The nature of the state and the restraining influences imposed by the state in teaching religion, Pakistan studies and history are also seen as one the reasons for aversion and indifference exhibited by the social scientists in participating in public policy research. Both the volumes produced by Akbar Zaidi (2003) and Inayatullah (2005) have cogent arguments by various authors dwelling on this point.

41. Public Policy practitioners, on the other hand, argue that there are very few sound empirical studies produced by the social scientists that are of relevance, are pragmatic and actionable for the resolution of the problems at hand. Either they are too narrow in scope and cannot be used for drawing broad generalizations or they lack rigorous approach. Some of them are too abstract and theoretical in nature or technical in their presentations that they do not make much sense in policy work. Others point out that the academics are too lax in meeting the timelines and as the policy makers work under pressures of deadlines these studies are of no use to them if they are made available after the deadlines. Another common complaint is that the policy recommendations are not implement-able as the researchers do not take cognizance of the constraints faced by the policy makers.

42. The above view points betray a lack of communication between the academics and the policy makers. In my own experience a few researchers and academics who work hard diligently, respond to the felt needs of the policy makers, keep their feet on the ground, produce their reports on time and engage in a continuous dialogue are always sought after and are in high demand. The danger is that they over extend themselves and their reputation for good quality begins to suffer.

43. Associated with the above trend is the limited pool of good researchers in the country and the competing demand for their services by the donors and increasingly by the media. The financial incentives given by the donors for consultancy work and the name recognition gained by exposure to the popular electronic media are distracting efforts from serious research work. Instant experts with no or little reservoir of new knowledge are found to recycle their views in talk shows and newspaper columns. If their opinions and comments were rooted in a continuous flow of research findings as happens elsewhere in the world the level of debate and discourse would be quite meaningful and not rhetorical. But off-the-cuff and seat-of-the pants comments unsubstantiated by either logic or evidence have become the common staple in this game. The more venom you exhibit against the Establishment and the more critical you are of the regime in power the more fans you add to your list and the more accolades you win at public places. This

vicious cycle whereby you don't have to produce any original work but rest on the laurels of the past and win public recognition and money is a serious impediment in the way of applied research. Public policy practitioners can neither pay as much as the donors provide nor they can make our instant TV experts a household name. Nadeem-ul-Haque and Mahmood Hasan Khan (1998) have dwelt on the issue of the donor intrusion in academic work in Pakistan in their analysis. The phenomenon of media intrusion is of more recent origin and needs to be monitored and documented.

44. The third inhibiting factor is the growth of private universities and their incessant appetite for Ph.ds serving as part-time faculty members. The “brief case” teachers who make regular visits to different private universities resuscitate their notes and deliver the same material to all the classes they teach. They do not have time for interaction with the students to respond to their questions or to provide clarifications they seek. The opportunity cost of doing slogging, careful, time consuming research work therefore becomes quite high. After all promotion in a public sector university is not a function of how prolific you are in research publications. So part-time teaching in addition to the regular job is a low risk high return endeavor.

45. The last but not the least important factor is the lack of adequate capacity within our universities and research institutes to cope up with this high demanding work. I am not talking about the numbers here because as a member of the search Committees of many research institutes and the State Bank of Pakistan I am struck by non-availability of well trained social scientists of Pakistani origin all over the world. Here I am concerned more with the analytical capacity to organize and lead research on the issues that I have identified above.

46. In his evaluation Inayatullah (2003) characterizes the social sciences moving in two directions in Pakistan: (a) Superficial speculative analysis or (b) Hyper factualism or abstracted empiricism. He notes that social scientists adopt a journalistic style of analysis of political events, of foreign policy approaches and in narrative and descriptive history and other disciplines. There is a tendency to explain events in terms of personalities and their particular attributes. Scientific analysis in terms of fundamental social processes, dynamic movements of history, the inter relationship between social parts and social wholes is less frequently undertaken. Qureshi (1989) analyzing the studies of history in Pakistan comments on the belief that Pakistan's foundation lies in religion and not in other factors. Such an attitude does not inculcate objectivity in viewing social phenomena but creates closed and unthinking minds incapable of scientific inquiry.

47. Naseem et al (1998), Haque and Khan (1998), have analyzed the economics teaching and research in Pakistan over a long period of time. Their findings and observations remain valid even today. According to Haque and Khan “Reflecting the pathology of larger feudal bureaucratic social order in Pakistan, the senior management (in Academia) generally follows the national model of centralized power without consultation and participation. A high proportion of the junior research and teaching staff finds itself in a patron –client relationship in which the patron has considerable power to punish and reward individuals. The personalized nature of power breeds mediocrity since salary, scholarship and promotion are rarely based on merit and personal achievement. Some of the senior research staff and faculty have achieved their positions through this system and suffer from a sense of insecurity.”

48. Naseem et. al (1998) are of the view that there is a lack of academic leadership (research credentials) to inspire the confidence of their younger colleagues.

49. My own observation after visiting leading universities, talking to faculty members and students, participating in teaching is that our public sector universities have evolved into bureaucratic organizations with inflexible status system that rewards non-academic assignments rather than excellence in teaching and research. The constant battle for capturing prize posts such as Registrar, Controller of Examinations, Deans, Chairmen testify to this observation. In such an environment it is hard to find the requisite analytical capacity to address the kind of tough issues that we have flagged.

WHAT CAN BE DONE TO PROMOTE SOCIAL SCIENCES RESEARCH ON PUBLIC POLICY ISSUES?

50. The agenda for reforming the social sciences teaching and research is so long and formidable that I do not know where to begin. But let me share with all humility my own thoughts as to the direction we should adopt. This is more in the spirit of provoking a debate rather than offering definitive answers.

51. First, the absence of solid empirical research based on primary data collection, surveys, structured interviews, field visits and observations can be filled in by requiring and guiding the students in Masters’ M.Phil, and doctorate programmes to actively participate in these activities. This will have two main advantages; (a) the students will dirty their hands with the real world problems (b) the empirical foundations of their theses and dissertations will become strong. The prospective bright candidates who cannot

afford higher studies because of the financial constraints can be offered research fellowships under the research grants available under various HEC programmes. I can assure you that there is not much dearth of money today but there is a dearth of good research proposals. If the research studies are centered around the challenges pointed out above the probability of successful funding would be high.

52. Second, we should establish the tradition of open seminars in which all the professionals working in the same field in a city should be invited to present their research proposals, their preliminary results and obtain feedback and critique before the papers are finalized. Recognizing that a critical minimum mass is missing in most social science faculties in any single university the involvement of professionals drawn from other universities, research institutes, think tanks, public and private sector, NGOs etc. would contribute to the improvement of the quality but also sharpen policy relevance of the findings. Lahore, Islamabad and Karachi offer excellent opportunities for such collaborative efforts in the first instance. This can be followed up by other cities such as Hyderabad, Faisalabad, Multan, Peshawar and Quetta.

53. Third, the research students in social sciences seem to get stuck after they complete their course work. They are at a loss to identify the research questions, formulate the hypotheses, choose the appropriate testing tools to apply to the data collected and arrive at inferences and conclusions. The deficiency can be overcome if there is greater interaction between the supervisor and the research students and there are more workshops offered for research methodologies and writing research proposals. As I pointed out there is a whole range of public policy questions that can benefit from systematic empirical research. SPDC's recent reports on Devolution and Trade liberalization are excellent examples of policy based research that is useful for further debate and influencing policy makers.

54. Fourth, the social sciences journals have to be upgraded by making them regular in frequency of publication, insisting on stringent peer review system, abstracting and indexing them and broadening the editorial boards. The HEC Social Sciences Committee has outlined the parameters for journals and is ready to support all such endeavors. We have a successful transition story that is of Lahore School journal of Economics that has been upgraded to a higher category. There is no reason as to why the Pakistani journals should not be treated at par with the foreign journals with the passage of time. It should be equally difficult to get published in the former as is the case as in the latter.

55. Fifth, the professional associations in different social science disciplines should be revived and strengthened. Besides organizing Conferences, Seminars and Workshops they should act as informal networks for collaborative research. In today's World with ease of connectivity and accessibility to internet and web it should be quite possible to have research papers jointly authored by professors for example in Bahauddin Zakaria University with SZABIST, Karachi. The Conferences should invite leading scholars from outside Pakistan to keep abreast of what is happening in their respective fields. The policy makers should be invited to participate in selected round table discussions on public policy issues alongwith the researchers who have carried out the work.

56. Sixth the present boundaries created by segmentation and narrow specialization should be broken by multi-disciplinary and inter-disciplinary studies. Rubina Saigol (2005) is quite right when she says that "most researchers though not all, seem to think that multidisciplinary means simply adding on material from another discipline or producing some perspective from another subject." Multi-disciplinary studies between psychology and economics now called 'Behavioral Economics' have provided new insights on the rationality theorem underpinning the neoclassical economic model. Similarly, the political economy and Institutional Economics literature has benefited from involvement of political scientists and public administration experts. Most public policy issues in Pakistan can be resolved only if we dissect them under a multidisciplinary microscope rather than a single lens prism of a particular discipline. I am disappointed that the Pakistan Studies Centers have not lived upto the expectations for which they were originally set up.

57. Seventh, the constraints imposed on the universities and academia in general to subscribe or follow a particular school of thought about religious thinking, ideology of Pakistan, history of separatism from India etc. should be removed. Competing or alternative ways of thinking provoke debate, discussion, discourse and further inquiry that challenge conventional wisdom and generate new knowledge continuously. Hostility towards other view points or defensiveness are not the right attributes for an academic community. These are the attributes of an intellectual graveyard. Some of the challenges facing Pakistan today would have been resolved if there was freedom to pursue independent thinking on some of these issues.

58. Before I conclude, there is another important issue that I would like to address in this paper i.e. demand for disciplines within the social sciences. Rubina Saigol (2005) believes that within social sciences History, Philosophy and Political Science have been seen a fall and in their place there has been a rise in business and administrative

education. She attributes this change to be in keeping with the rise of neo-liberal thinking and increasing authoritarianism and control, even as the state withdraws from the provision of basic needs. This statement appears to me self contradictory. The so called neo liberal thinking is associated with greater reliance on private sector for production, distribution and exchange of goods and services and aims to weaken the control and the authority of the state. Both the phenomena she has pointed out cannot take place at the same time. My own reading of the evidence is that the study of economics and business management appears to be motivated by financial returns. The implication of this trend is that the study of other disciplines that in fact are public goods should be undertaken by public sector universities which are heavily subsidized by the state. These other disciplines may have little market value but they generate externalities and lay the foundation for a socially and morally conscientious citizenship and humanistic understanding of the state, society, culture and institutions. These social sciences courses should be mandated for all students attending universities of Engineering, Medical, Agricultural Sciences, Physical and Biological Sciences, Business “Administration. These disciplines should be taught at all colleges imparting undergraduate education. The demand by these institutions for teachers in Philosophy, Psychology, History, Civics, Ethics and Social Sciences as a composite subject should divert some talented young men and women to pursue these subjects that will lead to gainful employment.

REFERENCES

1. Haq ue, Nadeem and M.H. Khan (1998), The Economics Profession in Pakistan, Pakistan Development Review Vol 37, No.4 Winter
2. Hashmi, S.A ed (1989), The State of Social Sciences in Pakistan, (Islamabad QUA Press)
3. Inayatullah (2003), “The Social Sciences in Pakistan: An evaluation” in Zaidi (2003)
4. Inayatullah, Rubina Saigol and Pervez Tahir (2005), Social Sciences in Pakistan: A profile (Islamabad Council of Social Sciences)
5. Jaffrelot, Christopher (ed) (2002), Pakistan: Nation, Nationalism and the State (Lahore, Vanguard)
6. Jalal, Ayesha (1994) The Sole Spokesman, Karachi Oxford University Press)
7. Mahbubul Haq Centre for Human Development, Human Development in South Asia (Karachi, Oxford University Press) 1999 and 2005
8. Naseem S.M, SK Qureshi and Rehana Siddiqui (1998) “Conditions of Teaching and Research in Economics” Pakistan Development Review Vol 37, No.4 Winter
9. Qadeer, M.A (2006) Pakistan: Social and Cultural transformation as a Muslim Nation ().
10. Qureshi, Naeem (1989) “Whether History” in Hashmi (1989)
11. Saeed, Shafqat (2003) quoted in Jaffrelot, C.
12. Saigol, Rubina (2005) “Conclusion” in Inayatullah (2005)
13. Weiss, Anita and Zuilfiqar Gilani (2001), Power and Civil Society in Pakistan (Karachi Oxford University Press)
14. World Bank (2005), Economic Growth in 1990s (Washington DC, World Bank)
15. Zaidi, Akbar (ed) (2003) Social Science in Pakistan in the 1990s. (Islamabad Council of Social Sciences)